

[Works Relating to Armenian Linguistics](#), at Internet Archive

ARM. CALR 'LAUGHTER'

FREDERIK KORTLANDT
LEIDEN UNIVERSITY

In his detailed and insightful analysis of the linguistic relationship between Armenian and Greek, James Clackson discusses Arm. *calr* (gen. *catu*) and Gr. γέλως 'laughter' at some length (1994: 126–132). He argues that "if the form **ġelAōs* [thus Klingenschmitt 1982: 147] had been inherited into Armenian then one would expect the pre-apocope reflex **celuh* which would have been assimilated, one assumes, into the normal *u*-declension" (127). But *calr* belongs to the small group of Armenian *u*-stem nouns with *-r* in the nominative which "can all be derived from Proto-Indo-European **u*-stem neuters" (126), e.g. *cunr* 'knee,' *artawsr* 'tear,' Gr. γόνυ, δάκρυ. Clackson identifies Arm. *asr* 'fleece' (gen. *asu*) with Latin *pecū* 'cattle' rather than Gr. πόκος 'fleece' and derives *calr* from **ġelu*, which is formally identical with Latin *gelū* 'ice' (131). As the discussion touches upon a series of controversial issues, I would like to clarify my position here.

It is noteworthy that *cunr* and *artawsr* are not inflected in the singular and thereby differ from *catr*, *asr* and *metr* 'honey' (gen. *metu*). This lack of inflection must have resulted from the apocope in view of the ease with which Armenian created new case forms, e.g. gen. *catēr* and *catru* beside *catu*, also *asru* and *asroy* beside *asu*. Elsewhere I have derived *artawsr* from a paradigm **drakur*, obl. **drakru-*, which yielded an alternation **-asur*, **-awru-* (1985:61). The analogy with **ma(θ)ir* 'mother,' **hwe(h)ur* 'sister,' obl. **mawr-*, **hwehr-*, may have given rise to a pre-apocope paradigm *arta(w)sur*, obl. **artaw(s)r-*, pl. *artasu-*. In the case of *cunr*, the comparison with Gr. γόνυ, gen. γουνός, pl. γοῦνα suggests a pre-apocope paradigm **cunur*, obl. **cung-* (which can easily have been replaced by **cunr-*), pl. **cunga*, distinct from the regular paradigm of **metur*, obl. **metu-*, cf. Gr. μέθυ, gen. μέθυος. This explains the existence of two different flexion types of *u*-stem neuters in Armenian.

Arm. *asr* 'fleece' must be identified with Gr. ποκυ- 'small livestock' (cf. Ruijgh 1992), with *o*-grade as in Arm. *cunr*, Gr. γόνυ, unlike Latin *pecū*, *genū*. In Armenian, the initial **p-* developed to **h-* which was lost before **o* and this vowel subsequently yielded *a-* in unstressed open syllables (cf. Kortlandt 1983: 10). Clackson objects that "the absence of *h-* in this word does not prove that the vocalism was originally *o*" because "there are clear cases of unexplainable aspiration or lack of it" (1994: 160). He mentions three instances, viz. *ayc* 'goat,' *acem* 'I bring,' and *ogi* beside *hogi* 'spirit' (218). However, Arm. *ayc* and Gr. αἴξ < **aiǵ-* beside **aǵ-* in Indo-Iranian and Balto-Slavic suggest an early borrowing, Arm. *acem* must be identified with Latin *gerō* < **Aǵes-* rather than *agō* < **Aeǵ-*, and Arm. *hogi* beside *ogi* can easily have restored the initial *h-* on the basis of the verb which is attested in *hewam* 'I pant' (cf. Kortlandt 1983: 14). The actual alternation between initial *h-* and zero turns out to fit the expected distribution rather nicely (cf. also Kortlandt 1984).

Following de Lamberterie (1978: 271), Clackson assumes "lowering of *-e- to -a- before -u- in the following syllable" in order to explain the root vowel of *catr* < **gelu* and *asr* < **peku* (1994: 159 and 126f.). Neither of them mentions Pedersen's superior treatment (1906: 414-422). It seems to me that the isolated form *heru* 'last year' < **peruti* suffices to disprove the rule. The hackneyed example *vat'sun* 'sixty' beside *vec* 'six' must be explained differently, as is clear from *k'ařasun* 'forty' beside *č'ork* 'four' and **awt'n* beside *ewt'n* 'seven,' also *k'ařord* 'fourth' replacing **t'ur-* and *tasn* 'ten,' -*lasan* '-teen' with -a- for *-e- from the ordinal (cf. Kortlandt 1994). The root vowel of *garun* 'spring' < **wesr* and *ariwn* 'blood' < **esar* shows the regular development of *-esa-, as distinct from *-i(h)a- < *-ēsa- in the aorist ending -*eac*' (cf. Kortlandt 1995) and from the anteconsonantal reflex of *-esr- in *k'erb* 'by sister' < **swesrbhi* and *jerb(-akal)* '(taken) by hand' < **ghesrbhi*. While de Lamberterie points to Meillet as the *Urheber des Lautgesetzes*, the latter had evidently given up the idea by the time he wrote the *Esquisse* (1936: 38, 39, 42, 55, 82). The initial vowel of *anun* 'name' represents *o- < *O, not *e- (cf. Kortlandt 1987: 63).

Thus, I think that we must identify Arm. *catr* with Gr. γέλως < **gelAōs*, obl. **glAs-*, cf. Arm. *gewt* 'village' < *-lō(i), gen. *gelj* < * -ly- (Klingenschmitt 1982: 61, 147, 154). Clackson tries to derive Gr. γέλως from *-ōu(s), acc. *gélō* (ōrse) for *-ow(a) (Od. 20.346), dat. *gélōi* (ékthanon) for *-owi (Od. 18.100), which does not account for the stem **gelas-* but "would match the reconstruction of a neuter u-stem for Armenian *catr*" (1994: 129f.). This leaves both the formation of Gr. γέλως and the root vowel of Arm. *catr* unexplained. The assumption that the two words represent different morphological formations in spite of their semantic identity must be rejected in favor of the hypothesis that the Armenian neuter u-stem paradigm reflects the "old and unproductive type of noun inflection" (131) which is found in

Greek. This does not affect the possibility of deriving the word from the same root as Latin *gelū* and English *chill*.

Looking for traces of words in **-ōs*, Clackson proposes to derive Arm. *ayg* 'dawn' from the locative **Aeusi* of **Aeusōs*, Gr. ἡώς (223). I find this etymology highly attractive. Clackson attributes the generalization of the vocalism to "the widespread use of locutions such as *ənd ayg* 'at dawn,'" to which I would attribute the loss of initial **h-*, as I would in *anagan* 'late,' *aṙawawt* 'morning,' which continue other case forms, with loss of **h-* as in *aṙagast* 'curtain,' cf. *(h)aganim* 'I put on clothes' (Kortlandt 1983: 13). Thus, we can reconstruct a paradigm **haw*, obl. **haw-*, acc. **hagn*, loc. **(h)ayg*. We now expect a pre-apocope paradigm **celu(h)* < **ġelAōs*, acc. **celon* or **celun* < **ġelAosm* or **-ōsm*, obl. **cal(a)-* < **ġlAs-*, and contraction of the stem-final **-a-* with the following ending. This pattern was evidently closer to **cunu(r)* < **ġonu*, obl. **cun(g)-* < **ġonw-* than to the regular *u*-stem flexion, which explains the transition of *catr* to the neuter paradigm. In the case of Gr. ἰδρώς 'sweat,' acc. *hidrō* < *-ōa* (cf. Il. 10.574), Arm. *k'irtn* < **swidrosm* or **-ōsm*, the oblique stem **k'itar-* < **swidrs-* was replaced by regular **k'irtan-*. These words provide evidence for a rather close relationship between Armenian and Greek.

REFERENCES

Clackson, James

1994 *The linguistic relationship between Armenian and Greek*.
Oxford: Blackwell.

Klingenschmitt, Gert

1982 *Das altarmenische Verbum*. Wiesbaden: Reichert.

Kortlandt, Frederik

1983 "Notes on Armenian historical phonology III: *h-*." *Studia Caucasica* 5: 9-16.

- 1984 "PIE *H- in Armenian." *Annual of Armenian linguistics* 5: 41-43.
- 1985 "Arm. *artawsr* 'tear.'" *Annual of Armenian linguistics* 6: 59-61.
- 1987 "Notes on Armenian historical phonology V." *Studia Caucasica* 7: 61-65.
- 1994 "Proto-Armenian numerals." *In honorem Holger Pedersen*. Wiesbaden: Reichert: 253-257.
- 1995 "The sigmatic forms of the Armenian verb." *Annual of Armenian linguistics* 16: 13-17.
- Lamberterie, Charles de
- 1978 "Armeniaca I-VIII: études lexicales." *Bulletin de la Société de linguistique de Paris* 73/1: 243-285.
- Meillet, Antoine
- 1936 *Esquisse d'une grammaire comparée de l'arménien classique*. Vienne: Mékhitharistes.
- Pedersen, Holger
- 1906 "Armenisch und die nachbarsprachen." *Zeitschrift für vergleichende sprachforschung* 39: 334-485.
- Ruijgh, Cornelis J.
- 1992 "*po-ku-ta* et *po-ku-te-ro*, dérivés de **poku* 'petit bétail.'" *Mykenaiika (Bulletin de correspondance hellénique, supplément XXV, École Française d'Athènes)*: 543-562